United Nations CAT/C/RUS/QPR/6

Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment

Distr.: General
13 June 2014

Original: English

Committee against Torture

List of issues prior to submission of the sixth periodic report of the Russian Federation due in 2016*

The Committee against Torture, at its thirty-eighth session (A/62/44, paras. 23 and 24), established an optional procedure which consists in the preparation and adoption of lists of issues to be transmitted to States parties prior to the submission of their respective periodic reports. The replies of the State party to this list of issues will constitute its report under article 19 of the Convention.

Specific information on the implementation of articles 1 to 16 of the Convention, including with regard to the Committee's previous recommendations[1]

Articles 1 and 4

1. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee (para. 7) expressing concern about elements not included in the definition of torture contained in article 117 of the Criminal Code, please provide detailed information on whether measures have been taken, or legal proposals are currently under consideration, to bring the definition of torture into full compliance with article 1 of the Convention, specifically with regard to criminal liability for acts of torture, attempted acts of torture or complicity in committing torture. Please provide comprehensive information, including statistical data, concerning the application of articles 117, 286 and 302 of the Criminal Code and other articles applicable to acts of torture (complaints, prosecutions, convictions) (para. 7), and whether any police, army personnel and/or other public officials have been prosecuted directly for torture under article 117? Please provide information on any measures taken by the State party since the previous review in November 2012 to reaffirm publicly and unambiguously the absolute prohibition of torture, including measures to make clear that perpetrators and those complicit or acquiescent in torture will be held responsible and subject to criminal prosecution and sanctions (para. 6)

* Adopted by the Committee at its fifty-second session (28 April–23 May 2014).

[1] Paragraph numbers in brackets refer to the previous concluding observations adopted by the Committee, published under symbol CAT/C/RUS/CO/5.

GE.14-05076 (E)
1405076

Please recycle

Article 2[2]

2. With reference to the previous concluding observations (para. 9) of the Committee expressing serious concern at the failure to ensure detainees have certain fundamental legal safeguards, please provide detailed information on the measures taken to prevent acts of torture, and in particular on the availability, from the very outset of their detention, of basic legal safeguards, in law and practice, for persons deprived of their liberty. In particular, please provide updated information on:

(a) Which measures guarantee detainees the right to access a qualified lawyer, obtain independent legal aid, contact family members, be informed of the charges against them and request and receive a medical examination by an independent physician promptly upon actual deprivation of liberty? Noting that the Federal Law of 7 February 2011 states that "the period of detention shall be counted from the moment of the actual restriction of freedom of movement for the person", please comment on the Report of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment on its 2012 visit,[3] which found that in practice safeguards "only become available from the moment of the first official interview by the investigator, i.e., several hours (and sometimes much longer) after the de facto apprehension and initial questioning by operational officers".[4] Furthermore, please clarify the differences in the rules governing safeguards available to the detainee in a criminal, as opposed to an administrative, case, particularly with regard to whether the individual accused can notify a relative or friend at his/her own initiative and within what time frame. Please clarify in which cases such notification remains the responsibility of the investigating officer. Please provide information, including comprehensive statistics, on how often detainees request to notify a relative directly and to have a medical examination by an independent physician, and how often and how promptly such requests are granted;

(b) Whether the State party ensures that all persons deprived of their liberty are registered promptly following their apprehension, and that lawyers and family members of detained persons have full access to the information in the registers;

(c) Whether there have been cases since 2012 in which public officials have been subjected to disciplinary or criminal penalties for failing to provide detainees with their fundamental legal safeguards (e.g., as outlined in subparagraph (c) above)? Please provide statistics on such cases where charges have been brought, including for which offences and the punishments meted out, as relevant;

(d) Whether video surveillance is installed in all areas of custody facilities where detainees may be present, and whether video recordings are made of all interrogations. Please clarify whether recordings are kept in secure facilities and made available to investigators, detainees and their lawyers. Please provide information on the number of

---

[2] The issues raised under article 2 could imply also different articles of the Convention, including but not limited to article 16. As stated in paragraph 3 of general comment No. 2 (2007) on the implementation of article 2 by States parties, "The obligation to prevent torture in article 2 is wide ranging. The obligations to prevent torture and other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment (hereinafter 'ill-treatment') under article 16, paragraph 1, are indivisible, interdependent and interrelated. The obligation to prevent ill-treatment in practice overlaps with and is largely congruent with the obligation to prevent torture. ... In practice, the definitional threshold between ill-treatment and torture is often not clear." See further chapter V of the same general comment.

[3] Report to the Russian Government on the visit to the Russian Federation carried out by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) from 21 May to 4 June 2012, CPT/Inf (2013) 41, Strasbourg, 17 December 2013.

[4] Ibid., para. 32.

police stations and other detention facilities in which interrogations are routinely audiotaped or videotaped, and the number of cases for which such recordings are not maintained;

(e) Whether there is effective monitoring of whether police wear identification badges when detaining people, including how many police have been disciplined or punished for not wearing required identification. In this regard, please comment on the statement of the Human Rights Ombudsman on 4 March 2014 that many police failed to wear identification badges during the post-Sochi protests (21 February–4 March 2014) during which there were allegedly over 1,000 detentions, fines, and administrative actions, and his observation that other persons engaged in the round-up or arbitrary detention of persons also remained unidentified. Please provide information on the number of citations, administrative fines or detentions, or criminal detentions that took place during this period, the number that were challenged and the results of those challenges.

3. Please provide information on the measures taken to prevent and combat violence against women in detention (para. 19). In particular, please provide information on measures taken to guarantee the possibility for confidential interviews with all complainants, to ensure the safety of interviewees and to ensure that the alleged perpetrators, including any co-conspirators that acquiesced to or facilitated those crimes, are identified and held accountable. Please provide data on the incidents reported, investigations, charges brought and dropped and convictions obtained, including information on the number of individuals concerned who may continue to serve in the same or other detention facilities. Please include information on any redress, including rehabilitative measures provided for complainants whose allegations have been verified. Please also comment on the findings following an inspection by the Presidential Council for Human Rights in women's penal colony No. 14 (IK-14) in Mordovia, which reportedly confirmed allegations by former detainee Nadezhda Tolokonnikova that prison officials there threatened inmates and forced them to work 11–17 hour days, and denied them food and toilet facilities if they did not meet quotas. Also, noting Presidential Council member Ilya Shablinsky's report that he received documentation on inter-prisoner violence and other abuse at IK-14, please describe any investigation(s) and measures taken to correct the conditions described, and whether any official was sanctioned or punished in connection with them? If so, please provide details as to the disciplinary measures or punishment, as well as current location and employment of persons concerned. Please also provide information on the results of any investigation concerning reports of violence against female detainees in IK-13 in Mordovia.

4. Please provide updated information on any steps taken to provide a definition of domestic violence in legislation and to ensure that all reported cases of violence against women are registered by the police (para. 14). What measures are taken to ensure that the victims of domestic violence and other forms of violence against women are provided with protection? With regard to the concerns expressed by the Committee in its previous concluding observations about persistent reports concerning acts of violence against women in the northern Caucasus, including so-called "honour killings" and bride-kidnapping, please provide information on the number of complaints received and the outcome of investigations into allegations on such violence against women and on the number and outcome of resulting prosecutions. Please provide information on measures taken to ensure that police officers refusing to register complaints of violence against women, including "honour killings" or bride-kidnappings or trafficking are held accountable.

5. Please provide information on whether a study was undertaken into the causes of suicides in detention (para. 18), and statistical data on the investigations of suicides in detention. Please provide information on measures by the Federal Penal Correction Service to enhance monitoring and detection of at-risk detainees and to take preventive measures

regarding the risk of suicide and inter-prisoner violence. Please provide information whether the rules governing medical examination of prisoners have been amended to ensure that examinations are carried out by fully independent medical personnel, that complainants are protected from reprisals, and that their complaints of abuse in detention are thoroughly investigated.

6. Please provide information whether any person found guilty of crimes constituting torture in violation of the Convention benefited from an amnesty (para. 13).

Article 3

7. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee (para. 17), please provide examples of decisions taken on cases relevant to article 3 of the Convention. Please provide information on cases when extradition of a person was refused because of a well-founded risk of torture or ill-treatment. Please also provide information on the number of cases in which extradition was granted, the countries to which individuals were returned, whether appeals mechanisms are in place, the number of persons who have appealed on the basis of article 3 and the outcome of such appeals. Please provide information on the monitoring and follow-up carried out to ensure that guarantees against torture and ill-treatment have been observed.

8. Please provide information whether the State party continues to rely upon diplomatic assurances concerning the extradition and expulsion of persons from its territory to States where they would face a risk of torture. Please also provide the Committee with the number and details of the type of diplomatic assurances received during the reporting period and the countries involved, as well as information on the existence of removal and post-removal monitoring mechanisms (para. 17). Please update the Committee on the current location and status of Alexey Kalinichenko,[5] including information on any monitoring mechanism used in the case.

Articles 5 and 7

9. Since the consideration of the previous report, please indicate whether the State party has rejected, for any reason, any request for extradition by another State of an individual suspected of having committed an offence of torture, and has started prosecution proceedings as a result. Please provide information on the status and outcome of any such proceedings.

Article 10

10. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee (para. 21), please provide information on measures taken to ensure that all persons enumerated in article 10 of the Convention are informed about the prohibition of torture. Please provide information about the training of law enforcement and military personnel on their obligations under the Convention. Please indicate when and how regularly such training is provided and indicate whether trainings are organized for: (a) law enforcement personnel and judges in order that they can initiate prompt and impartial investigations; and (b) military personnel in order that they are aware of the prohibition of torture and that an order from a superior officer may not be invoked as justification of torture.

11. Please provide information on the training for nursing, medical, paramedical and other professionals involved in the documentation and investigation of allegations of torture

[5] See communication No. 428/2010, *Kalinichenko* v. *Morocco*, decision adopted on 25 November 2011.

and ill-treatment in detecting signs and treating physical and psychological injuries resulting from torture and ill-treatment as outlined in the Manual on Effective Investigation and Documentation of Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Istanbul Protocol) (para. 10).

Articles 2 and 11

12. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee concerning the establishment of Public Oversight Committees (POCs) that can monitor places of detention (para. 11), please provide statistical data on the number of investigations into torture, ill-treatment and the denial of safeguards opened as a result of POC visits, and information about the outcome of such investigations (para. 11).

13. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee expressing concern that some POCs are not able to conduct unannounced visits, please provide information on the conditions governing access of POCs to all places of detention, including pretrial detention centres, administrative detention centres and police lock-ups, and provide a list of detention facilities visited during the reporting period. Please provide details of any concerns reported by POCs about possible violations of legislation detected during visits to places of detention, including the obstruction of visits, and indicate what action the authorities have taken in response to information from these bodies regarding possible violations, including investigations and disciplinary measures taken. According to the State party's letter replying to the Committee's Rapporteur on follow-up, POC members had been obstructed in Irkutsk and Sverdlovsk "as a result of ignorance" of Prison Service requirements, and disciplinary sanctions were imposed on six staff members of the penitentiary system in 2012. Please clarify the nature, length and form of those disciplinary punishments, and where the six staff are employed today, and at what rank. Please provide statistics on other such incidents during the reporting period.

14. Please provide information on the appointment of members of POCs (para. 11) and whether POCs are independent of regional and federal administrations. Please discuss how the independence and effectiveness of POCs has been affected by the appointment of new persons to replace the initial members of POCs. Noting the Committee's previous concerns regarding alleged acts against POC members, including Alexei Sokolov, please provide information on measures taken to ensure that POC members are protected from reprisals (para. 11).

15. Please provide information on measures taken to ensure that the findings and recommendations of POCs are made public in a timely and transparent manner and that all allegations of the denial of safeguards or instances of torture or ill-treatment are drawn to the attention of the competent authorities and are promptly, impartially and effectively investigated.

16. With reference to the previous conclusions of the Committee expressing concern over the death in custody of Sergei Magnitsky, please provide information on the outcome of the investigation into the reported neglect and ill-treatment associated with his death and whether anyone was prosecuted and punished in that case (para. 11). In particular, please provide information on the following:

(a) The reasons repeated requests for medical care and complaints from Mr. Magnitsky to the law enforcement authorities were rejected, as cited in the Council of Europe's Parliamentary Assembly report (document 13356 of 18 November 2013), in which its author Mr. Gross states that Mr. Magnitsky's mother provided him with a list of complaints (dated 9 August, 11 August, 31 August, 11 September, 14 September and 12 November 2009) and copies of the replies containing denials and refusals. Has there been an investigation to address the discrepancy between this and the information from Russian

officials who told Mr. Gross that Mr. Magnitsky did not lodge any complaints? If so, please provide information on the findings and any resulting sanctions. Please clarify how a detainee can obtain an independent medical examination, as prescribed by law;

(b) The requirements for maintaining a ledger in places of detention, particularly in view of the report that Valery Borshov, Moscow POC head, expressed concern regarding the accuracy of the ledger of complaints he reviewed when he visited Butyrka Prison the day after Mr. Magnitsky's death; and

(c) The current status of persons who were investigated or sanctioned in conjunction with the death of Mr. Magnitsky. According to the State party's reply to the Rapporteur on follow-up, (submitted in October 2013), several officials were disciplined or fired, including P.A. Karpov and A.K. Kuznetsov. However, later, the criminal case was dismissed reportedly because the court found that Mr. Magnitsky had died of heart failure, and not from pancreatitis or ill-treatment, torture or neglect.

17. Please provide information on any new interrogation rules, instructions, methods and practices, as well as arrangements for the custody of persons subject to any form of arrest, detention or imprisonment, that may have been introduced since the consideration of the last periodic report, and the frequency with which they are reviewed, with a view to preventing any cases of torture or ill-treatment.

18. Please clarify whether there has been an investigation or anyone has been disciplined following reports from POC members from Chelyabinsk, who on 27 November 2012 visited Kopeisk Colony No. 6 following a mass protest, and who reported obstruction and delay at the outset which was, in the end, corrected only by the intervention of Ombudsman Vladimir Lukin. Also, please explain why only 40 complaints were accepted when, according to a POC member, the observers examined copies of hundreds of complaints that had been submitted to the Investigative Committee, ranging from claims about alleged beatings by riot police (OMON) to claims of systemic abuse. Please explain the criteria for accepting complaints, what happens to those not accepted and the outcome of those from the Kopeisk incident.

19. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee (para. 23), please provide information on the complaints received from persons deprived of liberty alleging torture or ill-treatment, including statistics on their numbers and content. Please provide detailed statistical data, disaggregated by crime committed, ethnicity, age and sex, on complaints relating to torture and ill-treatment allegedly committed by law enforcement officials and on related investigations, prosecutions, convictions and the penal or disciplinary sanctions applied (para. 8). Please address allegations concerning Bashkortostan, Tatarstan and the Vladimir region reported by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) after its 2012 visit, specifically with regard to the alleged use of electric shocks, asphyxiation with a plastic bag, beatings, the so-called "televizor" technique and burns to the genitals.

20. Please provide information on the provision of financial and human resources to the subdivision of the Investigative Committee tasked with investigating crimes committed by law enforcement officials (para. 8). How many investigators are assigned to address complaints and has that changed over time? Are there territorial limits to the investigations by the Special Subdivision? Please provide information as to whether all complaints submitted to the Special Subdivision are investigated and, if not, whether (and under what conditions) another body is asked to examine them? Please comment on the allegations that only 1 of 200 cases handled by the Nizhny Novgorod Committee against Torture have been transferred to the Special Subdivision. Does the jurisdiction of the Special Subdivsion extend to examining complaints against the Ministry of Interior, the Ministry of Defence or

the Federal Security Service? Can torture victims apply directly to the Special Subdivision, and what has resulted from any such applications?

21. In view of the decision *Dzhabrailov v. Russia* by the European Court of Human Rights concerning the lack of investigations into abductions in Chechnya,[6] please provide data on the number of officials subjected to disciplinary measures for not adequately investigating complaints of torture or ill-treatment or refusing to cooperate in any such investigation (para. 8). Please also provide information about the number and results of any investigations into allegations concerning Circassians arrested during the Sochi Olympics and the detailed reports alleging the use of plastic bags over the heads of detainees to coerce them into confessing.

22. Please provide information on measures taken to ensure that all human rights defenders are able to conduct their work related to the prevention of torture and ill-treatment. Also, please provide information on the outcomes of investigations into allegations of intimidation, threats, attacks and killings of such persons, in particular, the killings of Anna Politkovskaya and Natalia Estemirova. Please update the Committee on whether these investigations have addressed those who planned or acquiesced in the murders, as well as those who may have fired weapons. Please comment on the report that Dagestani lawyer Sapiyat Magomedova has continued to receive death threats and that these have not been effectively investigated. (para. 12).

23. Please provide information on the measures taken to ensure that no individual or human rights group to which such individual belongs is subjected to reprisals or prosecution for monitoring incidents, and communicating with, or for providing information to, the Committee against Torture under its procedures, or to other human rights treaty bodies or United Nations human rights organs in accordance with their mandates. (para. 12). Please discuss measures directed against human rights defender Natalia Taubina of the Public Verdict Foundation, who participated in the Committee's review of Russia in 2012. Also, please clarify the status of the administrative proceedings brought against journalist Lena Klimova who wrote about and assisted communications among lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) teenagers and LGBT leaders, and the sentencing of environmental rights defender Evgeny Vitishko to a penal colony in 2014.

24. With reference to the letters of the Chairperson and the Rapporteur on reprisals, sent on 17 and 28 May 2013 on behalf of the Committee to the State party, please provide information on measures taken to apply article 13 of the Convention and paragraph 12 (b) of the previous concluding observations of the Committee, to ensure that civil society organizations, the Anti-Discrimination Centre "Memorial" and its leadership and the Foundation for Assistance in the Protection of Citizen's Rights and Freedoms "Public Verdict" and its leadership, in particular, are not subjected to any reprisals as a result of their legitimate activities, including providing information to the Committee against Torture.

25. Please provide information on the steps taken by the State party to amend its legislation requiring human rights organizations that receive foreign funding to register as "foreign agents"; and to review its practice and legislation regarding the crime of treason in the Criminal Code (para. 12).

26. Please provide information on the numbers and outcomes of investigations into allegations of acts of violence and discrimination against Roma and other ethnic minorities,

[6] See European Court of Human Rights, *Dzabrailov v. Russia* (application No. 1586), judgment, 9 April 2009.

migrant workers, foreign nationals and LGBT persons, the number and outcome of any resulting prosecutions and what redress has been provided to the victims (para. 15).

Article 14

27. In the light of the Committee's general comment No. 3 (2012) on the implementation of article 14, please provide information on redress and compensation measures ordered by the courts since the consideration of the last periodic report. That should include the number of requests for compensation that have been made, the number granted and the amounts ordered and actually provided in each case. Please also indicate what kind of rehabilitation programmes are provided to victims and whether they include medical and psychological assistance (para. 20).

28. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee, please provide information on steps taken to amend the State party's legislation to address the right of torture victims to redress, including compensation. Please also provide information about measures taken in that regard, including the allocation of financial and other resources for the effective functioning of rehabilitation programmes (para. 20).

Article 15

29. With reference to the previous concluding observations of the Committee (para. 10), please inform the Committee of the measures taken to combat the practice of torture to extract confessions, and ensure that, in practice, forced confessions are not used as evidence in any proceedings. Please provide information on whether judges ask all defendants in criminal cases whether or not they were tortured or ill-treated in custody and order independent medical examinations whenever necessary, particularly whenever the sole evidence of a defendant's guilt is a confession. Please provide information on the number of cases in which decisions were based on confessions, and the number in which confessions were deemed inadmissible on the grounds that they were obtained through torture, and indicate whether any officials have been prosecuted and punished for extracting such confessions and, if so, where they are presently employed.

Article 16

30. Please update the Committee regarding changes in law and practice regarding conditions of detention, including any information on the status of preparation of a plan to carry these out as requested by the European Court of Human rights in its pilot judgment *Ananyev v. Russia*[7] in which it cited such conditions and related legal and administrative safeguards as amounting to a "recurrent structural problem" in most of the 90 cases already decided by the Court.

31. Please provide statistical data on the number of deaths in custody, with a breakdown of the causes and details on the investigation of past incidents as well as prosecution and conviction of officials found to be responsible. Please also elaborate on the measures taken to prevent deaths in custody. Please update the Committee on the outcome of investigations and criminal cases on Pavel Drozdov and Sergei Nazarov, both of whom died in detention in 2012 (para. 6). In view of the report that officials found that Mr. Drozdov had died from pancreatic disease and that kicks, handcuffing and other use of force against him that were seen on video recordings could not have caused his death, please clarify whether any charges or other measures were imposed on officials for ill-treatment or torture? With

[7] See European Court of Human Rights, *Ananyev and Others v. Russia* (applications Nos. 42525/07 and 60800/08), judgment, 10 January 2012.

regard to Nazarov, please comment on the concerns raised by CPT that, after initial preventive action taken in that case, subsequent steps were delayed or ineffective, with criminal charges dropped in some instances without an interview by the investigator. Also please comment on the CPT finding that "a high level of mistrust" continues among detainees regarding the investigation of complaints. Please comment on the outcome of eight criminal cases against the Dalny department officials that followed.

32. Please provide information on the efforts taken to prohibit and eliminate hazing (*dedovschina*) in the Armed Forces and ensure prompt and impartial investigation of all allegations of hazing and deaths in the military. Please also provide information on the number and outcome of investigations of such cases, whether any prosecutions have taken place and with what outcome, as well as what redress has been provided for the victims (para. 16). In particular, please comment on the report that Chelyabinsk region human rights ombudsman Aleksey Sevastyanov found a sharp increase in servicemen admitted to psychoneurological hospital No. 2. because of suicide attempts, and that investigations were not conducted regarding alleged bullying that may have provoked that. Similarly, please comment on the report that, following a separate inspection, 22 servicemen from the Chebarkul tank brigade were admitted to the hospital from January to August as a result of suicide attempts. Please inform the Committee of other measures to prevent *dedovschina* and educate personnel that such action is impermissible and will be punished.

33. With reference to the previous conclusions and recommendations of the Committee please provide detailed information on the measures taken to prevent discrimination and abuses, including violent attacks and abuses against Roma and other ethnic minorities, migrant workers, foreign nationals and LGBT persons, please provide information on the measures taken to ensure their protection (para. 15).

34. Please provide information on the steps taken to ensure effective supervision and monitoring by judicial organs of any placement in institutions of persons with mental disabilities (para. 22). Please provide information on the measures taken to ensure effective safeguards for medical staff in such institutions on how to administer non-violent and non-coercive care to persons in such institutions, including ensuring the right of effective appeal, and through the independent monitoring of conditions, and the establishment of a complaints mechanism and guarantee of the right to counsel. Please also provide information regarding training provided to all personnel at such institutions (para. 22).

35. Please provide information on the number and outcome of investigations into complaints of violations of the Convention by individuals placed in such institutions, including those resulting in deaths, whether any prosecutions have taken place and what redress has been provided to victims (para. 22).

The situation in the Northern Caucasus

36. Please provide information on the measures taken to ensure that all complaints of denial of safeguards, torture, ill-treatment, abduction, enforced disappearance and extrajudicial killings, including acts of violence against women in the northern Caucasus, have been promptly, impartially and effectively investigated, that those responsible for such abuses are held accountable, prosecuted and sanctioned, and that victims of such abuses obtain redress (para. 13).

37. Please provide information on whether investigators of such complaints were able to compel the cooperation of local officials and whether any official who refused to cooperate was subjected to penalties (para. 13). In that regard, please address the allegation in the Russian media (e.g., *Novaya Gazeta*, 7 December 2013) that Sergei Bobrov's departure from his position as head of the Investigative Department of the Investigative Committee of

Chechnya resulted from his vigorous investigation of the disappearance/killing of three people in Geldagan, including S. and Z. Aydamirova, and a lack of cooperation from local officials and others. Please include information about the media report on an audiotape in which it is alleged that the head of the Shali Department expresses concern about the progress of the investigation into the triple murder, following which "both investigators were removed from special cases investigation".

38. Please discuss the results of the investigation into the criminal case (No 61129) resulting from complaints by Umalat Boltiyev, who, in August 2013, was allegedly detained and tortured with electricity, hospitalized, and forced to confess to the possession of narcotics, allegedly under threat of rape.

39. Please provide information about the number of Chechen law enforcement or Ministry of Internal Affairs officials prosecuted for acts in violation of the Convention, the number found guilty, and the punishments or discipline that followed. Has there been a prosecution in the case of the murders/abductions in Geldagan (see para. 37 above) and, if so, for what crimes and with what results.

40. Please provide information on the number of unresolved cases of enforced disappearance in the region, and whether family members of disappeared persons are regularly informed of the progress of investigations and any identification of remains (para. 13).

41. Please provide updated information on measures taken to respond to any threats of terrorism and please describe how these anti-terrorism measures have affected human rights safeguards in law and practice and how it has ensured that those measures comply with its obligations under the Convention.

General information regarding other measures and developments relating to the implementation of the Convention in the State party

42. Please provide detailed information on any other relevant legislative, administrative, judicial or other measures taken since the consideration of the previous report that implement the provisions of the Convention or the Committee's recommendations. That may include institutional developments, plans or programmes, including resources allocated and statistical data, or any other information that the State party considers relevant.